From David Burnett, 10 Madeline Terrace, Middletown, NY

A LIKELY PEDIGREE OF THE 18th CENTURY ROGERS FAMILY OF WESTCHESTER COUNTY, AND OF WALLKILL, ORANGE COUNTY, NY
(Charts 13-e, 13)

ISRAEL ROGERS = Mary Lounsbury (mar ca 1700)[1]
Res. Westchester County, New York, probably Rye

SRAEL ROGERS[2] = Sarah -----[6] (d by 1772)
n Wallkill, 736[3] (he or is father here in 1729)[4] 1767/8[5]

Nehemiah
Apprenticed for 5 years, 21 Jan 1717/8[7]

Mary
Apprenticed to a tailor, 29 Jan 1717/8[7]

Jeremiah
Apprenticed for 4 years, 3 months, 3 months, 30 Jan 1717/8[7]. Ulster Co. Militia, 1738, w/ Israel & James Rogers & William Faulkner (7a)

James
Apprenticed for 13 years, 30 Jan 1717/8[7]; in Wallkill, 1736[8]

9

SRAEL ROGERS
ca 1730; rob. over 21 n 1750[10]; called "eldest son" in father's will[11]; ilitia list 1772[12]

Elizabeth=William Wilkin
10 children; two named William and Jane[13]

Daniel
b. 1735
acc. militia list 1763.[14] Charged with theft. 1764.[15]

Mary

Rachel

James
Age 16 in militia list 1763.[16] In milist list 1772.[17] Rev svc. Mar Amy Bronson; d 13 Feb 1826[18]; too young to be father of Jane Rogers, and her brothers and sisters.

James
Militia list 1772[19] D ca 1785; no wife or children named in admin record.[20]

Samuel[21]
Militia list 177
Rev svc; b ca 17
d 1805; mar Rebe
Brown[23]

Elizabeth Wilkin=Daniel G. Rogers
[24](Mar 1 Jan 1784) B ca 1762; d ca 1811[25]
Mentioned in his grandfather's will.[26] With Wm Faulkner he witnessed a will, 3 Aug 1785.[27]
1790 and 1800 censuses.[28]

29

Israel Rogers
Rev svc (called I.R., Jr)[30]; 1790 census[31]; will 27 Mar 1792, proved 12 May 1795, no wife or children mentioned[32]

Robert
Militia list 1772[33]; rev svc[34]; 1790 & 1800 census[35]

Jonathan
Rev svc[36]; mar Martha Smith, 24 Jan 1779[37]; 1790 census[38]

William
B 1757?; rev svc; 1790 census; mar Elizabeth -----; D 21 Feb 1842[39]

Moses
Rev svc[40]; Mar Susanna Hill, 3 Nov 1782[41]

Benjamin
Mar Elizabeth Puff, 8 Mar 1792[42]; 1800 census[43]

Joseph

John

Aaron
1810 census

JANE ROGERS = WILLIAM FAULKNER[46]
b ca 1758[45] (b 1746, d 1831)
Mar 1 Jun 1779, Goodwill Presbyterian Ch, Montgomery, NY[47] d 19 Mar 1827; bur Goodwill Ch cemetery[48]

Sarah = ----- McClure
Mar before 1792[49]

Anna
Unmarried in 1792[50]

Solid lines: relationships established

Dashed lines: relationships conjectured

SEP 14 1980

NOTES TO THE ROGERS PEDIGREE CHART

1. William S. Pelletreau, Early Wills of Westchester County, New York, from 1664 to 1784. New York (F. R. Harper), 1898, p. 391. Raymond H. Lounsbury, "The Lounsbury Husband of Abigail Thomas", New York Genealogical and Biographical Record, XLIX (Apr. 1968), pp. 67-68. For Mary Lounsbury's ancestry see Winifred L. Holman, "Pennoyer and Lounsbury Notes", New England Historical and Genealogical Register (Boston), CVIII (1954), 287-291.

2. An Israel Rogers of Westchester County is named in the court records of Ulster County in 1729. Kenneth Scott, "Ulster County, New York, Court Records, 1693-1775", National Genealogical Society Quarterly, LXI (1973), 61. Could he be the father of this Israel Rogers, or this Israel Rogers himself?

3. Ulster County deeds, liber "DD", p. 365. His deed, and that of James Rogers, are both dated 17 Jun. 1736, suggesting a close relationship between them, possibly making them brothers.

4. In 1728 an Israel Rogers is listed as a freeholder in "Shawengongh", Ulster County. Edmund Bailey O'Callaghan, Lists of Inhabitants of Colonial New York. Baltimore (Genealogical Publishing Co., Inc.), 1979, p. 225.

5. Will, dated 17 Aug. 1767, in Collections of the New York Historical Society, Vol. 37 (1905), p. 226; a deed dated 29 Apr. 1768 speaks of "Israel Rogers, dec'd". Ulster County deeds, liber "II", p. 309.

6. Kenneth Scott, Genealogical Data from Administration Papers from the New York State Court of Appeals in Albany. 1972 (National Society of Colonial Dames in The State of New York), p. 267.

7. "Westchester County Miscellanea", New York Genealogical and Biographical Record (New York), LX (1929), 310. **(See note 7a, at end)**

8. Ulster County deeds, liber "DD", p. 363.

9. Collections of the New York Historical Society, Vol. 37, p. 226.

10. Scott, "Ulster County, New York, Court Records", Nat. Gen. Soc. Q., LXI, 61.

11. Collections of the New York Historical Society, Vol. 37, p. 226.

12. "A List of a Company of Foot Militia Commanded By Cap'n. William Faulkner, Taken the 13th Day of July, 1772", in Alfonso T. Clearwater, Ll.D., The History of Ulster County, New York. Kingston, New York (W. J. Van Deusen), 1907, p. 118. This could refer to his son, since the list calls him Israel Rogers, Jr., and the previous Israel Rogers, Sr., had died in 1767/8.

13. Emma McWhorter, Dolly Booth, Philip Seaman, The History and Genealogy of the William Bull and Sarah Wells Family. Middletown, New York (The Service Press), Second Edition, 1976, p. 158.

14. "Muster Rolls of New York Provincial Troops", Collections of the New York Historical Society for the Year 1891. New York, 1892, p. 482.

15. Scott, "Ulster County, New York, Court Records", Nat. Gen. Soc. Q., LXI, 208.

16. Collections of the New York Historical Society for the Year 1891, p. 484.

17. Clearwater, History of Ulster County, 119.

18. Ruth P. Heidgerd, Ed., Ulster County in the Revolution, 1977, p. 202.

19. Clearwater, History of Ulster County, 117.

20. Scott, Genealogical Data from Administration Papers, 267.

21. Called "oldest surviving brother of" James Rogers, Jr., in Ibid.

22. Clearwater, History of Ulster County, 118.

23. Heidgerd, Ulster County in the Revolution, 202.

24. Charles C. Coleman, Comp., The Early Records of the First Presbyterian Church at Goshen, New York, from 1767 to 1885. Goshen, New York, 1934, p. 14.

25. Orange County wills, liber "D", p. 431.

26. Collections of the New York Historical Society, vol. 37, p. 226.

27. Berthold Fernow, Calendar of Wills.., 1626-1836. New York, 1896, p. 36.

28. Heads of Families, New York, 1790, p. 184; "Federal Census, 1800, Orange County, New York, Town of Wallkill", New York Genealogical and Biographical Record, LXIII (1932), p. 306.

29. The will of Israel Rogers (IV) lists his brothers and sisters. Ulster County wills, liber "B", p. 196.

30. Heidgerd, Ulster County in the Revolution, 202.

31. Heads of Families, New York, 1790, p. 185.

32. Ulster County wills, liber "B" p. 196.

33. Clearwater, History of Ulster County, 118.

34. Heidgerd, Ulster County in the Revolution, 202.

35. Heads of Families, New York, 1790, p. 185; "Federal Census, 1800, Orange County, New York, Town of Wallkill", New York Genealogical and Biographical Record, LXIII, 306.

36. Heidgerd, Ulster County in the Revolution, 202.

37. Coleman, Early Records of the First Presbyterian Church at Goshen, 10.

38. Heads of Families, New York, 1790, p. 184.

39. Heidgerd, Ulster County in the Revolution, 202.

40. Ibid.

41. Coleman, Early Records of the First Presbyterian Church at Goshen, 14.

42. Ibid., 19.

43. "Federal Census, 1800, Orange County, New York, Town of Wallkill", New York Genealogical and Biographical Record, LXIII, 306.

44. "Third Census, 1810, Orange County, New York, Town of Wallkill", p. 485.

45. Grave stone, Good Will Presbyterian Church cemetery, Montgomery, New York.

46. William Faulkner is called "my brother-in-law" in the will of Israel Rogers (IV). Ulster County wills, liber "B", p. 196.

47. Janet Foley, Early Settlers of New York State, Vol. 3 (Jul. 1936), p. 8.

48. Grave stone, Good Will Presbyterian Church cemetery, Montgomery, New York.

49. Ulster County wills, liber "B", p. 196.

50. Ibid.

7a. Edward Manning Ruttenber and Lewis H. Clark, History of Orange County, New York, 1881, page 47.

THE TANGLED ISRAEL ROGERS PROBLEM AS AN EXAMPLE OF THE LIMITS OF CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE (or, THE SIGNIFICANCE OF A PATTERN OF CLOSELY ASSOCIATED NAMES)

Jane ROGERS (1757-1827) married William FAULKNER (1746-1831) of Wallkill, Orange County, New York, at Goodwill Presbyterian Church, Montgomery, New York, 1 June 1779. Numerous published references to the Faulkner family exist; who, on the other hand, were Jane Rogers' people?

The Faulkner and Rogers families had been closely associated since 1736 at the latest, when William Faulkner (died 1783-84, the father-in-law of Jane Rogers), James Rogers, and Israel Rogers all bought land on the same day from Thomas Noxon. Over the next five decades these three men were close neighbors; they served in the same militia units, their names appeared frequently in local records, and members of the next generation would fight together in the Revolution.

Those records, of Westchester and Ulster Counties, disclose the existence of as many as four men in the 18th century named Israel Rogers. That they are all in some way related seems pretty clear from the evidence. What I wish to do here is to try to sort out that evidence and reach some tentative conclusions about their relationships.

Taking the facts roughly in chronological order, we find:

1. Westchester County land records, liber B, page 146: John Lounsbury granted to his brother-in-law Israel Rogers (husband of Mary Lounsbury), 11 Aug. 1701, a parcel of land in the town of Rye. Because this deed was later found to be defective a second deed, to correct the first, was drawn up 23 Feb. 1703 (Westchester County deeds, liber C, page 370; both deeds quoted in New York Genealogical and Biographical Record, XCIX (1968), pages 67-68).

2. Westchester County miscellaneous records, liber 4, page 15: Israel Rogers witnessed the sale from John Cromwell to James Cromwell of a 25 pound right in the common, 1 March 1708 (quoted in ibid., LX (1929), page 307).

3. In the same volume of miscellaneous records, page 247, several children of Israel Rogers were apprenticed: a) 21 Jan. 1717/18, Nehemiah Rogers, son of Israel, apprenticed to Peter Ferris for five years and three months; b) 29 Jan. 1717/18, Mary, daughter of Israel and Mary Rogers, apprenticed to Henry Hunter, tailor. Page 261: c) 30 Jan. 1717/18, James, son of Israel and Mary Rogers,

apprenticed to John Bayly and his wife Elizabeth for thirteen years; d) the same date, Jeremiah, son of Israel and Mary Rogers, apprenticed to John Ferris for four years and three months.

4. An Israel Rogers is named as a freeholder in "Shawengongh", Ulster County, in 1728, along with Samuel, John, and Alexander Neely (see next item) (Elmer Bailey O'Callaghan, Lists of Inhabitants in Colonial New York, Excerpted from The Documentary History of the State of New York. Baltimore (Genealogical Publishing Co.), 1979, page 225).

5. Ulster County court records, recognizance, 29 Jan. 1728/29 "of John Neely of Rye, Westchester County, taylor; Israel Rogers, and John Neely (son of Thomas Neely, dec'd, both of Westchester County (my italics), yeoman, to testify against Tobias Weykent concerning the branding of a mare" (quoted by Kenneth Scott, "Ulster County Court Records", National Genealogical Society Quarterly, LXI (1973), page 61).

6. Ulster County deeds, liber DD, page 368, 16 Nov. 1731, Edward Jerr of Philadelphia, wheelwright, granted one thousand acres to "Israel Rogers of Ulster County, New York, shipwright". Part of the description of this land includes "...fourteen chains northwest from the corner of the land granted to Thomas Noxon..." (see next point).

7. In ibid., page 365, 17 June 1736, Thomas Noxon, schoolmaster of New York, granted to Israel Rogers, yeoman, 185 acres. Acknowledgement of possession was attested by James Rogers and William Faulkner, both of whom signed by mark. On the same day the same grantor transferred 300 acres to James Rogers, attested by Israel Rogers by signature and William Faulkner by mark; and 200 acres to William Faulkner, with possession attested by Israel Rogers and John Wilkin, both of whom signed by signature. On 21 Jan. 1767, Israel Rogers swore in court that he had witnessed this sale to Faulkner.

A question arises here. Is Israel Rogers, yeoman, the same man as Israel Rogers, shipwright? Does the one occupation rule out the other? If they were not the same man, what was the relationship (if any) between them? Is it significant that the two men (if different) appear so closely together in the same volume (liber DD) of Ulster County deeds? The sequence is: Thomas Noxon to James Rogers (page 363), Thomas Noxon to Israel Rogers (page 365), Richard Jerrard to Israel Rogers (page 368). This would seem to suggest that the yeoman and the shipwright were the same man, who recorded the two deeds at the same

time, except that it is noted on the records that the Jerrard transaction was recorded 2 June 1732, and the Noxon sale was recorded 7 June 1739. I confess that I am at a loss to explain these details, but considering that Israel Rogers in the 1760s disposed of considerably more than the 185 acres he acquired from Thomas Noxon, he had to have gotten the additional land from someone.

8. In E. M. Ruttenber and L. H. Clark, History of Orange County, New York, Philadelphia (J. B. Lippincott and Co.), 1881, page 47, militia list of the company of Capt. John Bayard, 1738, the following men are listed consecutively:

William Faulkner
Israel Rogers
Jeremiah Rogers
James Rogers

The first, second, and fourth men all bought land from Noxon in 1736; the third and fourth are known (point 3, above) to have been sons of Israel Rogers of Westchester County.

9. Ulster County court records, 25 Sep. 1745, "Jeremiah Murdock, weaver, and Israel Rogers, yeoman, both of Ulster County, for Murdock to answer a charge of bastardy brought by Susannah McNeall, single woman (daughter of John McNeall, Jr., of Wallkill)". (Scott, "Ulster County, New York, Court Records, 1693-1775", National Genealogical Society Quarterly, LXI (1973), page 61). See point 11, below.

10. Ulster County court records, 15 April 1751, recognizance "of Israel Rogers, Jr., and Israel Rogers, Sr., both of Ulster County, for Israel Jr. to answer a charge of wounding in the neck a mare belonging to John McNeall, Jr." (quoted in ibid., LXI, page 140).

11. Petition, 13 March 1764, to lay out a public road, in the Precinct of Wallkill, "...to the line between Israel Rogers' and John Barrot's, and so along the said line as the ground will allow, till opposite the corner of Alexander Patterson's fence, and so along that line to the south side of William Faulkner's land, and so straight up to the house of the Widow McCord, allowing her two gates, and from thence as the ground will allow to James Rogers' house, and so along the line between him and John McNeal's, and so along to John McNeal's mill...." Transcriptions of Early County Records of New York State, Prepared By the New York State Historical Records Survey Project, Division of Professional and Service Projects, Works Projects Administration. Records of the Road Commissioners of Ulster County, Volume II, 1769-1795. Albany (The Historical

Records Survey), 1940, pages 5-6.

12. Petition, 1 May 1769, to lay out a road, in the Precinct of Wallkill, "...to James Willkin's house on the north side of it, and then along the line of the sd. James and Israel Rogers to the Long Hill to the corner tree of John Willkin and Israel Rogers aforesaid". "And also another private road laid out beginning at the southeast corner of Israel Rogers' land, and so along the line between him and James Willkin, and so along the line between the sd. Israel Rogers' and James Rogers' till it come...." Ibid., Volume 1, 1722-1769, page 96.

13. Path masters in 1767 in the Town of Montgomery included Israel Rogers "from John McNeal's mill to Capt. Faulkner's, and the road to Dinaps to Israel Rogers." An Outline History of Orange County.... Newburgh (S. T. Callahan), 1846-47, pages 230-231.

14. Capt. William Faulkner's Company of Ulster County foot militia, 13 July 1772, included: James Rogers, Jr.,
Sam'l Rogers and Solomon Rogers, listed consecutively,
Israel Rogers, Jr., and Robert Rogers, listed consecutively,
and James Rogers.

Alfonso T. Clearwater, LlD, editor, The History of Ulster County, New York. Kingston, N.Y. (W. J. Van Dusen), 1907, pages 117-119.

The significant points in this array of evidence, it seems to me, are:

1. Israel and Mary (Lounsbury) Rogers had children Nehemiah, Mary, James, and Jeremiah. So much is known from Westchester County apprenticeship records. Could they have had a son named Israel? Quite likely, for if he was the eldest son, he might not appear in apprenticeship records because he was expected to follow in his father's footsteps, and inherit his father's land and/or occupation, in which case he would have been apprenticed, formally or informally, to his own father, and therefore would not appear in official apprenticeship documents.

2. The name Israel Rogers appears, first in Westchester County (lastly in 1717/8), then in both Westchester and Ulster Counties (in 1728/9) together with John Neely, and finally in Ulster County alone (in 1731, or 1736 if we assume that the shipwright and the yeoman were two different men). This point seems to establish satisfactorily the link between Westchester and Ulster Counties.

But here we encounter a second question. Which Israel Rogers went from Westchester to Ulster County? The last Westchester County date is the apprenticeships of January 1717/8. The first Ulster County date is the freeholders'

list of 1728, and then the recognizances of Israel Rogers and John Neely of Westchester County, 29 January 1728/9. With a ten year gap in the evidence, it seems impossible at this point to say for certain. Were I to guess, I'd say it was the second Israel Rogers who went to Ulster County, chiefly because of the 1736 land sale from Thomas Noxon to Israel and James Rogers (and Israel's testimony in 1767 about the 1736 sale from Noxon to William Faulkner), whom I suspect were brothers, sons of the first Israel Rogers.

3. The purchase, together on the same date, of land by Israel Rogers, James Rogers, and William Faulkner in 1736. Still to be explained is how the Rogers men and William Faulkner came to be closely enough acquainted that they all bought land on the same day from the same man, and witnessed each others' transactions. I suspect the answer to that question may lie somewhere in Westchester County. Is there any significance in the fact that, in attesting to these deeds, Israel Rogers signed with a signature and James Rogers signed by mark?

4. The 1738 Ulster County militia list, which names an Israel Rogers together with two known sons of the Israel Rogers of Westchester County (1717/8). The senior Israel Rogers would by then probably have been too old for militia service as he would have been nearly sixty years old, which would seem to support the belief that he had a son named Israel, perhaps his eldest son. Their being listed consecutively, and in this particular order (Israel, Jeremiah, James) may also be significant: that was perhaps the order of their birth.

5. The naming of an Israel Rogers, Sr. and Jr., together in 1751, in connection with the mare wounding incident. Although the terms senior and junior did not necessarily denote father and son in those days, the way they're named here, and in this kind of document, would seem to argue that such was the case in this instance.

6. The Israel Rogers, Sr., in point 5 is unlikely to have been the Israel Rogers of the 1701 and 1703 Westchester County land documents. He swore in January 1767 that he had witnessed the Noxon-Faulkner land deal of 1736. It is possible that a man old enough (aged at least 21, presumably) in 1701 to execute a land transaction was still alive sixty-six years later, but it seems on balance unlikely. More reasonable, I think, is to suppose that this Israel Rogers, Sr., is the second of the name, and the same one whose will is dated 14 August 1767, the essentials of which are as follows:

> Israel Rogers, Senr, of Wallkill, Ulster County. Wife Sarah. Sons: Israel (eldest), Daniel, James. Daurs.: Elizabeth, Mary, Rachel.* Grand-

*10 shillings each to Israel, Elizabeth, Mary, Rachel

son Daniel Graham Rogers. Son-in-law William Wilkin. Exrs.: wife, son James, son-in-law William Wilkin. Wit.: David Clarke, William Reynolds, Pet^{r} Berry. Dated 17 Aug. 1767. Probated, New York, 15 Nov. 1785

Collections of the New York Historical Society for the Year 1904: Abstracts of Wills on File in the Surrogate's Office, City of New York, Volume XIII, September 3, 1784 – June 12, 1786, 1905, pages 226-227.

Over eighteen years separate the writing of the will from its probate. Why so long? I don't know. However this gap can be narrowed a bit. A citation of 4 June 1772 names James Rogers and William Wilkins as executors of the estate of Israel Rogers, deceased, because "Sarah Rogers, wife of the deceased, has died". Kenneth Scott, Genealogical Data from Administration Papers from the New York State Court of Appeals in Albany (National Society of Colonial Dames in the State of New York), 1972, page 267. And, a deed from James Rogers, Jr., to Israel Rogers, dated 29 April 1768 (Ulster County deeds, liber II, page 309), involved a "certain tract of land which belonged to Israel Rogers, dec'd". So Israel Rogers, the second of that name, evidently died between 17 Aug. 1767 and 29 April 1768, leaving a gap of only eight months, rather than 18 years.

Both Daniel and James Rogers, mentioned in the above will, appear in the militia list of Ulster and Orange Counties, 28 Nov. 1763, Capt. Faulkner's company, Daniel aged 28 and James aged 16 (Collections of the New York Historical Society for the Year 1891 (New York, 1892): Muster Rolls of New York Provincial Troops, 1755-1764, pages 482-485). In 1759 an Israel Rogers, aged 28, blacksmith, born in Elizabeth Town, New Jersey, was serving in the militia of New York County. The age is about right, but whether he is the same Israel Rogers who was brother of Daniel and James is problematical.

The next problem, it seems to me, is to identify the father of the Israel Rogers whose will was dated 27 March 1792 and probated 5 May 1795 (Ulster County wills, liber B, page 195). Its significant points are:

Israel Rogers of Wallkill, Ulster County. Brothers: Jonathan, William, Joseph, John, Robert, Benjamin, Moses, Aaron. Sisters: Sarah McClure, Jane Folcaner, Anna Rogers. To Samuel Davis, Richard Davis, Patrick Davis. To Sarah Reed and her two daughters Rachel and Aruba. A bequest of 20 pounds to help buy a parsonage for the congregation of Neelytown. Exrs.: Robert Rogers, brother-in-law William Falconer, William Bull. Wits.: Joseph Whelan, Jason Wilkin, Jonathan Swezy.

Since he names all his brothers and sisters in his will, we have some help here. We can, for example, eliminate Daniel Rogers as the father, because he

(Daniel) had a son named Daniel Graham Rogers, who was not named in the above will. Moreover, the James Rogers of the 1767 will and the 1763 militia list was probably too young to have been the father of thirteen children by the time of the 1792 will. The 1792 testator's sister Jane, who married William Faulkner in 1779, is figured from her grave stone (d. 19 March 1827, aged 69 y.) to have been born in 1758 or 1759. She is not named in the 1767 will (which will named only six children in any case). If the Daniel and James Rogers of the 1767 will are ruled out, the "eldest son" Israel Rogers of that (1767) will becomes a prime candidate as the father of the writer of the 1792 will, and his twelve brothers and sisters. Now, if Jane (Rogers) Faulkner was born in ca. 1758, her father would have to have been born in 1735, give or take a few years. Was her father the Israel Rogers, Jr., of the mare wounding incident of 1751? If so, he was probably then in his late teens at the youngest.

And another mystery: who was the Israel Rogers who married Jane Boen (Bowen? Brown?) at Goodwill Presbyterian Church, 3 March 1780? I might go out on a limb here and speculate that it was the same man who wrote the 1792 will. If that is the case, they must have had no children, and she must have predeceased him, since the will names only brothers and sisters, not a wife and children. In the published 1790 federal census, Town of Wallkill, Ulster County, an Israel Rogers is listed (page 185) with four males age 16 and over, one male under sixteen, and three females. These numbers, for a childless couple, could be accounted for, at least in part, if his household included unmarried brothers and sisters.

We must next consider an interesting series of land transactions, all involving the same piece of property, beginning with the sale from Thomas Noxon to Israel Rogers in 1736 (Ulster County deeds, liber DD, page 365):

> Beginning at a black oak stake and three black oak saplings marked round it on four sides of James Rogers' land, and thence runs northwest fifty chains to the westerly line of the patent, thence southwest thirty seven chains to a white oak marked on four sides, thence southeast fifty chains to the land of James Rogers, and thence along his line northeast thirty seven chains to the first station, containing the just quantity of one hundred eighty-five acres of land.

On 29 April 1768 James Rogers, Jr., deeded to Israel Rogers the exact same piece of land. When and how he acquired it from the first Israel Rogers I have so far been unable to discover. At least part of this land may have passed from Israel Rogers to James Rogers 17 Oct. 1766 (300 acres, liber FF, page 369), and/or 29 April 1768 (liber II, page 309), as suggested by comparing descriptions,

and the names of Col. Elison and John Barrett (Ulster County deeds, liber II, page 309):

> The lot or tract whereon the said Israel Rogers now lives, lying in a certain tract of land formerly granted by letters patent to Thomas Noxon, bounded as follows: at a black oak stake and three black oak saplings (after 32 years?!) marked round it on the line of the lands of James Rogers, Sr., and running thence northwest fifty chains to the westerly line of said patent, thence southwest thirty seven chains to a white oak marked on four sides, thence southeast fifty chains to the lands of the said James Rogers, Sr., thence along his line thirty seven chains to the place of beginning, containing one hundred and eighty-five acres.

Next, on 2 May 1775, Israel Rogers, Sr., deeded the same land to Israel Rogers, Jr., and Robert Rogers (Ulster County deeds, liber II, page 315):

> Some part of a certain tract of land granted by letters patent to Thomas Noxon (whereon the parties aforesaid now live) and bounded as follows: beginning at a black oak tree standing on the northwestermost corner of the lands formerly belonging to James Rogers and running thence northwest fifty chains to the westerly line of said patent, thence southwest thirty seven chains to a white oak marked on four sides, thence southeast to the said James Rogers' land, thence along the same northeast thirty seven chains to the first station, containing one hundred and eighty five acres.

Finally, on 8 March 1783, from Robert Rogers to Israel Rogers, Jr., as follows (Ulster County deeds, liber II, page 313):

> All that tract or lot of land whereon Israel Rogers, Sr., now lives and bounded as follows (being some part of a tract of land formerly granted by letters patent to Thomas Noxon): beginning at a black oak tree, standing on the northwestermost corner of the lands formerly belonging to James Rogers and running thence northwest fifty chains to the westerly line of the said patent, thence southwest thirty seven chains to a white oak tree marked on four sides, thence southeast to the said (formerly) land of James Rogers, thence along the same northeast thirty seven chains to the place of beginning, containing one hundred and eighty five acres, more or less.

As I interpret this series of transactions, omitting for the moment the numerous other Rogers land deals that took place during this same period, and realizing that the designations senior and junior did not at that time necessarily refer to father and son, but could also mean an uncle and nephew, or any older and younger person with the same names living close to each other, we may hypothesize that the James Rogers was called "junior" in the second transaction described above because he had an uncle James, specifically the other Rogers who bought land from Thomas Noxon in 1736. Thus this James, junior, was a son of Israel Rogers, and in 1768 he was selling his brother Israel the same piece of land that their father had bought in 1736.

In 1775, now called Israel Rogers, Sr., he sells the same plot of land to Israel Rogers, Jr., and Robert Rogers. Since we know from the 1792 will that an Israel Rogers and Robert Rogers were brothers, it may be reasonable to suppose that a father is here disposing of land to two of his sons. Then in 1783, Robert relinquished his share of ownership to his brother, now designated as Israel, Jr.

Other significant land sales include Israel Rogers to William Wilkin, 200 acres, 24 Oct. 1765 (liber FF, page 303). No relationship is stated here, but William Wilkin was the grantor's son-in-law. He married Israel Rogers' daughter Elizabeth. Then there is Israel Rogers to "son James Rogers", 200 acres, 30 Oct. 1765 (liber FF, page 289), and Israel Rogers to "son James Rogers, 300 acres, 17 Oct. 1766 (liber FF, page 369). I don't know if it is significant or not, but in not one of these land deals involving a Rogers as a seller is there any mention of a wife's release of dower. These sales, clustered together in a brief span of time, together with Israel Rogers' will of 17 Aug. 1767, which bequeaths land ("all that land with my house and buildings thereon lying in the Precinct of Wallkill whereon I now live...") only to his son Daniel Rogers, and that only after the decease of his mother, suggests that Israel Rogers was aware that the close of his life was approaching, so he undertook to dispose of his holdings.

And all this raises another question. Why, in two deeds, does Israel Rogers specifically call James Rogers his son, yet in no other transaction among men named James, Israel, or Robert Rogers, or William Wilkin, is a relationship stated, even though there was obviously a blood or in-law relationship of some kind? My guess is ~~that~~ that the reason was that there were several James Rogers then living in the vicinity, so the relationship was made explicit to avoid ambiguity. In the cases of grantees Israel and Robert Rogers, and William Wilkin, there was no such problem.

Nor have we here explored fully the untidiness of the Rogers pedigree. Various Ulster County records mention other Rogers men who can't be conveniently fitted into the family with the information presently available. Who, for example, was Solomon Rogers? He appears in the 1772 militia list, was charged with assault in 1775, fought in the Revolution, and appeared in the census lists of 1790 (one male 16 and over, one male under 16, four females) and 1800. Who was Matthias Rogers, named in the 1800 census? There are, moreover, more men named James Rogers than I am altogether comfortable with; I have, I think, identified

at least three. There is the James Rogers of the 1717/8 apprenticeship and the 1736 land deal with Thomas Noxon. Then there is the James Rogers named in the 1767 will of Israel Rogers. I tentatively identify him as a nephew of the first James Rogers. But there is also a letter of administration, 28 Nov. 1785, in the estate of James Rogers, Precinct of Wallkill, to his oldest surviving brother Samuel Rogers (Dr. Kenneth Scott, Genealogical Data from Administration Papers from the New York State Court of Appeals in Albany, 1972 (National Society of Colonial Dames in the State of New York), page 267). It is possible that this James and Samuel Rogers were sons of the first James Rogers, but I have no proof of that. With at least three men named James Rogers, who must have all been alive together for part of the time, it is difficult to know which one is meant in each case.

But that is why I speak of "The limits of circumstantial evidence" in the title. I fear this essay has suggested much and proved little. A test of the effectiveness of circumstantial evidence is, does it reasonably exclude other interpretations and conclusions? While I believe the above conclusions carry a very high degree of probability, and I think the preponderance of evidence favors them (I have, for example, found no evidence that opposes it), there are still entirely too many loose ends in the form of too many unattached, free-floating Rogers men of that time and place for me to be entirely satisfied. We must regrettably, therefore, return a Scot's verdict: not proved.

Any comments and suggestions, to help sort out what has here probably been badly muddied, will be greatfully welcomed. However, based on the above facts and speculations, I am going to suggest the following pedigree:

1. ISRAEL ROGERS[1], lived Rye, Westchester County, New York. b. and d. dates unknown. M. ca. 1700, MARY, dau. of Richard and Elizabeth (PENNOYER) LOUNSBURY. Children, b. prob. Rye, New York:

1. i. ISRAEL[2], b. ca. 1700-01
   ii. Nehemiah
   iii. Mary
   iv. Jeremiah
   v. James

2. ISRAEL ROGERS[2] (Israel[1]), b. prob. ca. 1701 and perhaps at Rye, N. Y. He d. Wallkill, Orange County (but at that time part of Ulster County), N. Y., 1767-68. He mar. Sarah (-----) who d. by 1772.

Children, named in the following order in Israel[2] Rogers' will:

3. i. ISRAEL[3], b. ca. 1730, "eldest son"

ii. Elizabeth, m. William Wilkin, son of John Wilkin. Children: Sarah, John, Robert, Daniel, James, William, George, Elizabeth, Jean

iii. Daniel, b. ca. 1735. Child Daniel Graham, whose will was dated 12 Nov. 1808, probated 12 July 1811.

iv. Mary

v. Rachel

vi. James, b. ca. 1747

3. ISRAEL ROGERS[3] (Israel[2-1]), lived Wallkill. Dates of birth and death, and wife's name unknown. Children, (order of birth ~~is~~ highly conjectural):

i. Jane, mar. 1 June 1779, William Faulkner

ii. Israel, mar. 3 March 1780, Jane Boen. Will dated 27 March 1792, probated 12 May 1795. 1790 census: 4 males 16 and over; 1 male under 16; 3 females. Residence: Wallkill.

iii. Jonathan, mar. 24 Jan. 1779, Martha Smith. 1790 census: 1 male age 16 and over, 3 males under 16, 3 females.

iv. Moses, mar. 3 Nov. 1782, Susanna Hill.

v. Robert, mar. 15 Dec. 1789, Mary Brown. 1790 census: 2 males age 16 and over, 2 females, 2 slaves. Residence, Wallkill.

vi. William, 1790 census: 2 males age 16 and over, 3 males under 16, 2 females. Residence: Wallkill.

vii. Sarah, mar. before 1792, (James?) McClure.

viii. Benjamin, mar. 8 March 1792, Elizabeth Puff.

ix. Joseph

x. John

xi. Aaron

xii. Anna